(Ānâpāna,samādhi) Kimbila Sutta

The Kimbila Discourse
(on the Mindfulness of In-and-out Breathing)
[Satipatthana through breath meditation]

(Saṁyutta Nikāya 54.10/5:322-325)

Translated by Piya Tan ©2005

1. Breath meditation

The mindfulness of the in-and-out-breath, or more simply, the breath meditation or the mindfulness of breathing (*ānâpāna,sati*), "is generally regarded as the most important meditation subject taught in the Nikāyas."[1] Besides the famous **Ānâpāna,sati Sutta** (M 118),[2] there is a whole collection, **the Ānâpāna Saṁyutta** (S 54), comprising 20 suttas, in the Saṁyutta Nikāya. **The Kimbila Sutta** shows how all the sixteen phases of breath meditation is done as satipatthana or focus of mindfulness (*satipaṭṭhāna*) practice. In fact, this sixteen-phase formula is first introduced in **the Eka,dhamma Sutta** (S 54.1),[3] the first sutta of the Ānâpāna Saṁyutta, and repeated throughout the collection.

The sixteen phases or aspects of breath meditation are not "steps," as they are not necessarily sequential but overlap in parts. The first four phases are found in **the Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta** (D 22; M 10), in the section on the contemplation of the body.[4] The sixteen phases are divided into four tetrads and each item of a tetrad itself a dyad relating to the in-breath and the out-breath. Each tetrad is correlated with one of the four satipatthanas, giving the practice a wider range.

The Pali Commentaries say that it is the breath meditation that the Buddha practises on the night of his awakening, followed by the attaining of the four dhyanas and the three super-knowledges, and that during his ministry he would occasionally go into a breath meditation retreat, often lasting three months. In **the Icchānaṅgala Sutta** (S 54.11), the Buddha calls it "the Tathagata's dwelling," recommending it to both learners and arhats. For the learners, it leads to the destruction of the cankers; for the arhats, it is the basis for a pleasant dwelling here and now and to mindfulness and full knowing.[5] This correlation is first explained in **the Kimbila Sutta**, but recur in several later suttas in the collection.[6]

The commentary on this sutta has been translated by Ñāṇamoli in *Mindfulness of Breathing* (1964:49-52). For the notes of this Sutta Discovery translation, see the Ānâpāna,sati Sutta (M 118) in SD 7.13.

(2) Sutta summary

2.1 THE TETRADS. The Kimbila Sutta (S 54.10) opens with the Buddha questioning Kimbila on the breath meditation. Kimbila, however, is unable to answer and remains silent though he is asked three times. Ānanda then intervenes and suggests that the Buddha himself answers for the benefit of the monks (and posterity). The Buddha goes on to teach satipatthana by way of the 16-step breath meditation in this manner:

The 1st tetrad (steps 1-4)	contemplation of the body	[§10]
The 2nd tetrad (steps 5-8)	contemplation of feelings	[§11]
The 3rd tetrad (steps 9-12)	contemplation of mind	[§12]
The 4th tetrad (steps 13-16)	contemplation of phenomena	[§13]

[1] Bodhi, S:B 1516.
[2] M 118/3:77-88 = SD 7.13.
[3] S 54.1/5:311 f.
[4] D 22.2/2:290 = M 10.4/1:56 = SD 13.
[5] S 54.11/5:325-328.
[6] On **Ānâpāna,sati Saṁyutta,** see S:B 1516 f.

This practice clearly shows the reciprocal impact of both mindfulness of the breath and the four focusses of mindfulness (*satipaṭṭhāna*). When one is cultivating the mindfulness of the breath, one is cultivating the four focusses of mindfulness, and when one is cultivating the four focusses of mindfunless, one is cultivating mindfulness of the breath.

The first section of the satipatthana instruction is on the theoretical level or preliminary practice; the second part of the teaching explains how with the overcoming of the mental hindrances—"exertive, fully aware, mindful, the monk dwells contemplating <the satipatthanas>, removing covetousness and displeasure for the world" [§§15, 17, 19, 21][7]—one perfects the practice. The sutta closes with the Buddha using the parable of the four chariots and the crossroads to show how the four satipatthanas work [§22].[8]

2.2 ĀNÂPĀNA,SAMĀDHI. The main text of the (Ānâpāna,samādhi) Kimbila Sutta is identical to that of **the Ānâpāna,sati Sutta** (M 118),[9] that is, the divisions on "the cultivation" and "the perfection" of the breath meditation; the division on the seven awakening-factors has been omitted. It is interesting to note that at the sutta opening, the Buddha uses the term "concentration by the mindfulness of the in-and-out-breath" (*ānâpāna,sati,samādhi*), whereas the usual term is simply *ānâpāna,sati* (the mindfulness of the in-and-out breath). Morever, the sutta ends with the attainment of dhyana, and the last section of M 118—the seven awakening-factors—are missing. Apparently, this special teaching given to Kimbila evidently leads only to samadhi, unlike the fuller sutta at M 118. This last missing section—the seven awakening-factors—are, however, found in the breath meditation taught to Ānanda in two other suttas in the same Ānâpāna Saṁyutta:

(Satipaṭṭhāna) Ānanda Sutta (S 54.13):[10]	the Buddha teaches Ānanda how the 4 satipatthanas bring the 7 awakening-factors to fruition.
(Ānâpāna,sati) Ānanda Sutta (S 54.14):[11]	the Buddha teaches Ānanda how the breath meditation brings the 7 awakening-factors to fruition.

2.3 THE PARABLE OF THE CHARIOTS AND THE CROSSROADS. Although the four satipatthanas are traditionally given in the sequence: watching the body, watching feelings, watching the mind, and watching dharmas, once the mental hindrances are abandoned, dhyana is attained. However, the same parable also applies to the attaining of insight, which the practitioner will attain when he becomes familiar and adept with the practice. The essential unity of the four satipatthanas is evident from this parable of the chariots and the crossroads at the end of **the Kimbila Sutta** (S 54.10):

> Suppose, Ānanda, at a crossroads there is a great mound of soil. If a cart or chariot were to come from the east,…from the west,…from the north,…from the south, it would flatten that mound of soil.
>
> So, too, Ānanda, when a monk dwells contemplating the body in the body,…feelings in the feelings,…the mind in the mind,…dharmas in the dharmas, he would "flatten" evil unwholesome states. (S 54.10/5:325)[12]

The Commentary explains that the six sense-bases are like **the crossroads**; the defilements in the six senses are like the mound of soil there. The four satipatthanas occurring in regard to their four objects are like the four carts or chariots. The destruction (*upaghāta*) of evil unwholesome states is like the flattening (*upahana*) of the mound of soil by the cart or chariot (SA 3:273). As such, we can conclude that this

---

[7] For nn, see same at §15.

[8] This is actually part of the "basic satipatthana formula": see **Satipaṭṭhāna Ss** = SD 13.1(3.II), (4.2) & (4.3b).

[9] M 118.17-27/3:82-85. While **the Ānâpāna,sati S** is addressed to "monks," the Kimbila S is addressed to Ānanda.

[10] S 54.13/5:328-333.

[11] S 54.14/5:333 f.

[12] SD 12.22.

meditation of the breath as taught to Kimbila involves satipatthana with dhyana.[13]

2. Kimbilā & Kimbila

2.1 THE TOWN KIMBILĀ. **Kimbilā** was a town on the banks of the Ganges. It was in a bamboo forest (*velu,vana*), or according to the Aṅguttara Commentary, more probably a *nicula,vana* (that is a forest of Barringtonia acutangula), which it explains as a *mucalinda,vana,* a mucalinda forest.[14] It was there the Buddha and where Kimbila stayed, and where the Kimbilā Suttas were taught.[15] There was apparently another Kimbila, also a seth's son from Kimbilā [2.3]. The city existed in the time of Kassapa Buddha and was the residence of the woman who later became Kaṇṇa,muṇḍa,petī.[16] Among the places seen by Nimi when he visited the heavens was that of a deva who had been a very pious man of Kimbilā.[17] From Kimbilā, too, came the pious Rohaka, and his wife Bhadd'itthikā.[18]

2.2 THE MONK KIMBILA. **The monk Kimbila** (also Kimila or Kimmila) of our sutta was a Sakya of Kapilavatthu. The Dhammapada Commentary has a story about how delicately nurtured Kimbila was, with quaint stories of his naivety. One day, for example, while talking with his friends, Anuruddha and Bhaddiya, about where rice came from, Kimbila remarked that it came from the granary (*koṭṭha*).[19]

He joined the order with Bhaddiya and four other Sakya nobles at Anupiyā, shortly after the Buddha's visit to Kapilavatthu.[20] According to the Dhammapada Commentary, Kimbila became an arhat soon after ordination together with Bhagu.[21] The Theragāthā Commentary gives a dramatic account of how came to join the order: while at Anupiyā, the Buddha, in order to rouse Kimbila into saṁvega, conjured up a holographic sequence of beautiful woman in her prime, passing the aging process.[22] Greatly agitated, Kimbila sought the Buddha, who admonished him, after which he entered the Order, and in due course became an arhat.[23]

Kimbila seems to have been long-term comrades with Anuruddha and Nandiya, dwelling together in one forest residence after another. The Buddha visited them at Pācīna,vamsa,dāya (the Eastern Deer Park) when he was going away, disgusted with the recalcitrant monks of Kosambī.[24] They were in the Gosiṅga sal grove when the Buddha taught them **the Cūḷa Gosiṅga Sutta** (M 31), at the conclusion of which, the yaksha Dīgha Parajana sang the praises of all three.[25] Their number grew with the presence of Bhagu, Kunda,dhāna, Revata and Ananda, at the time when the Buddha gave **the Nalaka,pāna Sutta** (M 68) in the Palāsa,vana at Nalaka,pāna.[26]

In the time of Kakusandha Buddha, Kimbila was a householder, who, after the Buddha's death erected a pavilion of *salala*-garlands[27] round his caitya.[28] Kimbila is probably the Saḷala,maṇḍapiya Thera of the Apadāna.[29]

---

[13] See **Satipaṭṭhāna Ss** = SD 13.1(4.3b).
[14] AA 3:323.
[15] S 35.242/4:181 f (**Dāru-k,khandha S 2**), S 54.10/5:322-325; A 5.201/3:247.
[16] Pv 2.12/30-32; PvA 150 f.
[17] See **Nimi Jātaka,** J 541/6:121.
[18] Vv 22.4; VvA 109.
[19] DhA 1.12/1:133-138, 25.12/4:124-128.
[20] V 2:182; DhA 1.12/1:133-138.
[21] DhA 1.12/1:138; see also J 1:140 and AA 1:191.
[22] A similar psychic manifestation is done by the Buddha to queen Khemā (DhA 24.5/4:58 f).
[23] ThaA 1:244; see Tha 118, 155 f.
[24] V 1:350; J 3:489; see also **Upakkilesa S** (M 3:155 ff; ThaA 2:30 f) = SD 5.18.
[25] M 31/1:205-211.
[26] M 68/1:462-468.
[27] The *salala* is a tree with sweet-scented flowers.
[28] ThA 1:244; ApA 559 f.
[29] Ap 1:333; cf Ap 2:522.

2.3 THE KIMBILA SUTTAS. The Saṁyutta contains three discourses given by the Buddha to Kimbila.[30] His concern over the survival of the Buddha's Teaching is reflected in three suttas in the Anguttara, where the Buddha admonishes him.[31] All these teachings took place in the Veḷu,vana (or Nicula,vana) in Kimbilā. According to the Anguttara Commentary, however, it seems that the Kimbila mentioned here was not Kimbila the Sakya but another, but Kimbila II.[32] We are told that this Kimbila II was also a seth's son of Kimbilā. He joined the order and acquired the power of knowing his previous births. He recollected how he had been a monk at the time when Kassapa Buddha's Dispensation was declining, and seeing how it was neglected by its followers, he made a stairway up a cliff and lived there as a recluse. It was this memory of his previous life which prompted Kimbila's question.

— — —

The Kimbila Discourse
(regarding the Mindfulness on In-and-out Breathing)

(S 54.10/5:322-325)

1 Thus have I heard.

At one time the Blessed One was staying in the Bamboo Forest near Kimbilā.[33]

2 There the Blessed One addressed the venerable Kimbila thus:

"How is it now, Kimbila, that the concentration by mindfulness of the in-and-out-breath[34] is cultivated and often developed so that it is of great fruit and great benefit?

When this was said, the venerable Kimbila was silent.

3 A second time, the Blessed One addressed the venerable Kimbila *in the same way.*

A second time, the venerable Kimbila was silent.

4 A third time, the Blessed One addressed the venerable Kimbila *in the same way.*

A third time, the venerable Kimbila was silent. **[323]**

5 When this was said, the venerable Ānanda said this to the Blessed One:

"It is now the time, venerable sir! It is now the time, Sugata [welcome one]! May the Blessed One speak on the concentration by mindfulness of the in-and-out-breath!

Having heard it from the Blessed One, the Ānanda, will remember it."

"Well then, Ānanda, listen and pay close attention, I will speak."

"Yes, venerable sir," the venerable Ānanda replied in assent.

6 The Blessed One said this.

---

[30] S 35.242/4:181 f (**Dāru-k,khandha S 2**), S 54.10/5:322-325.

[31] A 5.201/3:247, 6.40/3:339 f, 7.56/4:84 f.

[32] AA 2:232 f ; see DPPN: Kimbila 2.

[33] Kimbilā: see Introd (2.1).

[34] *Ānâpāna,sati,samādhi.* The usual term is *ānâpāna,sati.* The sutta ends with the attainment of dhyana: as such, this special teaching given to Kimbila evidently leads only to samadhi, unlike the fuller sutta at M 118. "In-and-out-breathing" *ānāpāna.* Another Indian word for breath is *āna,* as found in the dvandva *ānâpāna,* usually rendered as "in and out breath," sometimes used interchangeably as "out and in breath." The word *ānā* has the Latin cognate of *anima* (breath, soul) as in found such English words as "animal," "animated," etc. The Paṭisambhidā,magga Comy say: "*Ānaṁ* is air going inwards; *apānaṁ* is air going outwards. Some, however, say it is the other way around" (PmA:Ce 320). See **Ānâpāna,sati S** (M 118) = SD 7.13 ad loc.

7 And how, Ānanda, is the mindfulness of the in-and-out-breathing developed, and how is it often cultivated so that it is of great fruit and great benefit?[35]

CULTIVATION OF THE MINDFULNESS OF THE IN-AND-OUT-BREATHING [= Ānâpāna,sati Sutta (M 118.17-22/3:82,24-83,19)]

Physical preparation

8 [M 118.17] Here, Ānanda, a monk[36] who has gone to the forest, or to the foot, of a tree, or to an empty house,[37] sits down, and having crossed his legs and keeping his body upright, establishes mindfulness before him.[38]

9 —Mindfully[39] he breathes in, mindfully he breathes out.

---

[35] See *The Middle Length Discourses* 2nd ed 2001:1190 f nn140-142. This section is identical to that of **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10.4) except for the similes in the latter. The whole section on the Mindfulness of the Breath (M 118.16-22) here is identical to that of **Mahā Rāhul'ovāda S** (M 62.25-29/1:425-427). The Mahā Rāhul'ovāda S ends by stating that breath meditation benefits one in that "even the final in-breaths and out-breaths are known as they cease, not unknown" (M 62.30), that is, the practitioner dies with a calm and clear mind. (The para numbering from 8-14 is conjectural as I am uncertain of the PTS para numbering.)

[36] DA on **Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S** with the identical context here says that "monk" (*bhikkhu*) indicates "whoever undertakes that practice…is here comprised under the term *bhikkhu*." See Dh 142; also Dh 362, 260-270. Cf the **Bhikkhu Vagga** (ch 25) and the **Brāhmaṇa Vagga** (ch 26) of Dh.

[37] This stock phrase of 3 places conducive to meditation are at D 2:29; M 1:56, 297, 398, 425, 2:263, 3:82, 89, 4:297; S 5:311, 313, 314, 315, 316, 317, 323, 329, 336; A 1:147, 148, 149, 3:92, 100, 4:437, 5:109, 110, 111; Pm 1:175, 2:36. In **Sāmaññ,phala S** (D 2), probably an older account, the following instruction is given: "Possessing this aggregate of noble moral virtue and this aggregate of noble sense-restraint and this aggregate of noble mindfulness and clear knowledge and this aggregate of noble contentment, he seeks out a secluded dwelling: a forest, the foot of a tree, a mountain, a glen, a hillside cave, a charnel ground, a jungle grove, the open air, a heap of straw" (*so iminā ca ariyena sīla-k,khandhena samannāgato iminā ca ariyena indriya,saṁvarena samannāgato iminā ca ariyena sati,sampajaññena samannāgato imāya ca ariyāya santuṭṭhitāya samannāgato vivittaṁ senâsanaṁ bhajati, araññaṁ rukkha,mūlaṁ pabbataṁ kandaraṁ giri,guhaṁ susānaṁ vana,patthaṁ abbhokāsaṁ palāla,puñjaṁ,* D 2.67/1:71): this stock passage also at **Sāmaññ,phala S** (D 2) = SD 8.10.67 (2005). The oldest reference to an ideal meditation spot is in **Ariya,pariyesanā S** (M 26) and **Saṅgārava S** (M 100): "still in search of the wholesome, seeking the supreme state of sublime peace, I walked by stages through Magadha until eventually I arrived at Senānigama near Uruvelā. There I saw an agreeable spot, a delightful grove with a clear-flowing river with pleasant, smooth banks and nearby a village for alms resort. I sat down there thinking: 'This is conducive for spiritual striving.'" (M 26.17/1:167 = 100.13/2:212).

[38] ***Parimukhaṁ*,** lit "around the mouth," here always used idiomatically and as an adverb, meaning "in front": so U Thittila (Vbh:T 319, 328), Walshe (D:W 1995:335), Soma Thera (1998:42 f digital ed), and Ñāṇamoli & Bodhi (M:ÑB 2001:527). The Vibhaṅga explains it as "at the tip of the nose or at the centre of the upper lip" (Vbh §537/252): see important n to §18(1). **Where to watch the breath?** Brahmavamso, however, says that *parimukha* does not mean "just on the tip of the nose, or on the lip, or somewhere in from of your eyes…[but] just means [to] make it important." (2002:58). "Often people are told when meditating to watch the breath at the tip of the nose, but actually many people find this is a distraction. If you look at the suttas, the Buddha never tells us to watch the breath in a physical place. He says to know that you are breathing in and to know that you are breathing out. The important thing is to note it in time. So: 'Am I breathing in at this time, or am I breathing out at this time?'" (Nyanadhammo, "The Spiritual Faculties," 1999:3). Soṇa Bhikkhu, however, teachers the "traditional" approach of taking *parimukhaṁ* as air contact as "either at the nose or lip" (2000:6). See Introd (2) above. (All three teachers here are students of Ajahn Chah.)

[39] Ce Se Ke PTS *sato*.

SYNOPSIS: THE SIXTEEN ASPECTS

A. The first tetrad: Contemplation of the body

[M 118.18]

10 (1) Breathing in long [deep],[40] he knows: 'I breathe in long [Long in-breath]';[41]
Or, breathing out long [deep], he knows: 'I breathe out long [Long out-breath]';
(2) Or, breathing in short, he knows: 'I breathe in short [Short in-breath]';
Or, breathing out short, he knows: 'I breathe out short [Short out-breath]';[42]
(3) He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, experiencing the whole body (of breath)';[43]
He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, experiencing the whole body (of breath)';
(4) He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, calming the bodily function (of breathing]';[44]
He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, calming the bodily function (of breathing)';[45]

---

[40] Brahmavaṁso: "As one relaxes and settles down, the breath becomes short by itself. When the body is relaxing, you don't need as much oxygen to give the body energy. So it's quite natural that these two steps usually follow one after the other. The whole point of these two steps [long breaths, short breaths] is just to experience the breath instead of attending to many things. What you're doing is to focus on one thing." ("The Beautiful Breath," 1999; also 2002:59 f). On these 4 tetrads and 16 aspects, see Anālayo, *Satipaṭṭhāna,* 2003:133-136. On the breath, see **Ānâpāna,sati S** (M 118) = SD 7.13 Introd (1cd).

[41] I have rendered these important sentences and those of the first 2 ("noting") tetrads using very short sentences (not grammatically complete sentences) to reflect a "bare noting" (denoted by ***pajānāti***) that should occur in meditation whose purpose is mental focus. Only the steps 1-4 are noted by *pajānāti* (he knows or understands); the rest (5-16) are ***sikkhati*** (he trains) or "training" aspects (ie one has to put in more regulated effort), "I will breathe in…out," (*assasissāmi…passasissāmi*). On "mental noting," see important n on "Mental noting": **Ānâpāna,sati S** (M 118) = SD 7.13 Introd (3).

[42] In practical terms, focussing on the first 2 factors of this tetrad, that is maintaining one's undivided focus on the breath or one's conception of it can lead to *jhāna.* However, in **(Pabbateyyā) Gāvī S**, the Buddha warns Moggallāna not to go into the 2nd *jhāna* until he has thoroughly mastered the 1st *jhāna* (A 9.35/4:418 f qu at Vism 153 f).

[43] "Experiencing the whole body (of breath)," *sabba,kāya,paṭisaṁvedī.* MA glosses *sabba,kāya* as "the whole body of breath" that is, its three phases of each in-breath and out-breath through its three phases of beginning, middle and end (Brahmavamso, 2002:60). Brahmavaṁso keeps to this tradition, teaching that "you have just the target in your mind—just the breath and nothing else…the full attention on the breath" ("Beautiful Breath," 1999). "You see it from the very start when it originates out of the silence, and you see it grow to its peak and then fade away again, until the in-breath has completely subsided. You have such a degree of clarity that you even see that space between the breaths. The in-breath has stopped, the out-breath has yet to arise. There's a pause there. Then the out–breath begins to grow to it peak and then fade away into nothingness again. That's what we call **the whole of the breath**" (2002:60). However, Thich Nhat Hanh (1990:6, 46-49) & esp Bodhi (2001 n141) take *sabba,kāya* to mean "the whole physical body." Cf the remark that the in-and-out-breathing is "a body among the bodies" (§24). According to transpersonal psychology (especially bodywork and breathwork), the whole *body* "breathes." For the simile of the teacher and his three archer students illustrating the experience of the total breath, see Brahmavamso 2002:62 f. For a discussion, see Anālayo, *Satipaṭṭhāna,* 2003:131 f.

[44] "The bodily function," *kāya,saṅkhāra.* The bodily formation is the in-and-out-breathing itself (M 44.13). This calming process may lead to the development of *jhāna,* but this is not the primary object here (Walshe 1995 n641). See **Cūḷa Vedalla S** (M 44.14) for explanation of *kāya,saṅkhāra.* Brahmavaṁso: "Once you have full attention on the breath, the next stage is where the beauty and the bliss have a chance to arise… This is where you calm down that object of mind, the breath, by giving the suggestion, 'calm, calm, calm.' Instead of just an ordinary breath that you're aware of, you deliberately, by an act of will, calm that breath down…it gets softer and softer…more and more beautiful. But you have to be careful here…If you calm the breath in the fourth stage before you complete the third stage, that's when you go to sleep… When the attention is fully there, then calm that object inside your mind." ("Beautiful Breath," 1999). "If you calm the breath in this fourth stage before you complete the third stage, that's when you go to sleep. You haven't got a complete image of the breath in your mind yet, and you are already calming the little you do have. Get the full attention of the breath first of all. When the attention is fully there, then calm that object inside your mind." (Brahmavamso 2002:65).

B. The second tetrad: Contemplation of feelings

[M 118.19]

11 (5) He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, experiencing joy [zest]';[46]
He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, experiencing joy [zest]';
(6) He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, experiencing happiness';[47]
He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, experiencing happiness';
(7) He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, knowing the mental formations [mental functions]';[48]
He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, knowing the mental formations [mental functions]';
(8) He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, calming the mental formations [mental functions]';[49]
He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, calming the mental formations [mental functions]';

---

[45] At this point even after the breath has been calmed down but one still does not experience joy (*pīti*) or the "beautiful breath," the one should proceed to the next two steps to willfully arouse feelings of joy. (Brahmavamso 2002:66).

[46] "Joy," *pīti.* Sometimes translated as "rapture," but "**zest**" is closer to evoking the more subtle yet enthusing nature of *pīti*. However, in this sutta tr I have rendered *pīti* as "joy" and *sukha* as "happiness," following Brahmavamso to be consistent with his commentaries used here. One experiences joy (*pīti*) in two ways: by attaining either the 1st or 2nd *jhāna* in which joy is present, one experiences it in the mode of calm (*samatha*); by emerging from that *jhāna* and reflecting that joy is subject to destruction, one experiences joy in the mode of insight (*vipassanā).* Psychologically, *pīti* is a kind of "joyful interest," as such may be associated with wholesome, unwholesome or neutral states (BDict: pīti). Joy belongs the formation group (*saṅkhāra-k,khandha*) while happiness (sukha) belongs to the Feeling Group (*vedanā-k,khandha*). Joy is compared to when a thirsty man lost in the desert finds water; happiness is what he feels when he is drinking the water. See Vism 4.94 ff.

[47] Brahmavaṁso: "As you calm the breath down, you get to the stage where the breath becomes very, very refined, very peaceful, and very smooth. It is the nature of such a mind state that it should be very happy… This is another type of happiness, and it takes wisdom to be able to recognize it…the Buddha taught the fifth and sixth steps to arouse that [unarisen] beauty." The 5th step is the deliberate arousal of joy (*pīti*) with the beautiful breath; the 6th step is the deliberate arousal of happiness (*sukha*). "This is one important training in meditation, to be able to extract the perceptions of happiness and joy from whatever you're doing…When the breath is very peaceful, search for that bliss and you will find it. " This is what Brahmavaṁso calls **"the beautiful breath."** ("Beautiful Breath," 1999; 2002:68). When the mind is very peaceful, one only need to look for the joy in it to find it.

[48] "Knowing the mental formations [mental functions]," *citta,saṅkhāra,paṭisaṁvedī.* This refers to the experience of **the breath as a dharma [mind-object].** "When the beautiful breath is established, it may appear that your breath has disappeared, that you have just this beautiful, stable peace inside but no breath. What has happened is that you are still breathing, but the breath is no longer being experienced as a touch on the body, instead <u>it is experienced as an object in the mind</u>. You are switching from feeling to knowing. The sense base of physical touch turns off and the mind turns on… You are still breathing but the knowing is so focussed that the experience is like a smooth flow in one direction only." (Brahmavamso 2002:68 f). He then gives **the simile of the carpenter sawing**: "When a carpenter begins to saw a piece of wood he can see the whole saw from the handle to the tip of the saw blade. As he concentrates on the cut, his attention focusses closer and closer onto the point where the saw touches the wood. The handle and tip of the saw soon disappear from his vision. After a while, all he can see is the one saw tooth, that tooth which is in contact with the wood now, whereas all the other saw teeth to the left and to the right are now beyond his range of perception. He does not know nor needs to know, whether that tooth is at the beginning or middle or end of the blade. Such concepts have been transcended." (2002:69). The same method given in the previous note applies to the second and third clauses. According to some teachers, in the second, the three lower *jhāna* are present and in the third, all four are present. Mental formations here refer to feelings, perceptions and other mental concomitants, and which are calmed by the development of successively higher levels of calm and insight. See **Cūḷa Vedalla S** (M 44.14) for explanation of *citta,saṅkhāra.*

[49] "Calming the mental formations [mental functions]," *passambhayaṁ citta,saṅkhāraṁ.* "It can happen at this and subsequent stages of the meditation process that the joy and happiness become a little bit too exciting and therefore disturb the tranquillity. Because of this the Buddha taught the eighth step… Alternatively, fear can arise alongside the bliss: 'This is a bit too much for me.'…And, again, the bliss leaves. The fear destroys the tranquillity." (Brahmavamso 2002:70). He then relates Ajahn Chah's famous **simile of the forest pool** in detail (2002:71 f).

C. The third tetrad: Contemplation of the mind

[M 118.20]

12 (9) He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, experiencing the mind';[50]
He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, experiencing the mind';
(10) He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, gladdening the mind';[51]
He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, gladdening the mind';
(11) He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, concentrating the mind';
He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, concentrating the mind';[52]
(12) He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, freeing the mind';[53]

---

[50] "Experiencing the mind," *citta,paṭisaṁvedī.* According to Brahmavaṁso, "It's only at this stage that you can know the mind… **the only place where you can actually experience the mind**…by what we call a *nimitta*, a reflection of the mind. Remember the mind is that which is 'knowing.' How can the 'knower' know itself? Only like a person who looks at himself in a mirror. Only that way can you see your face, can you see your reflection. The reflection you see here, the *nimitta,* is a true reflection of the mind. It's as if the mirror has finally been cleaned of all this dust and grime on its surface, and now at last you can see yourself. You can experience the mind (*citta,paṭisaṁvedi*) through the *nimitta.* (2002:73; see 73 f for **simile problems**). The *nimitta* is just a reflection of the "knower," the meditator's mind: one's image in the mirror only reflects one's looks and does what one does! If the watcher is still, the image, too, is still. It does not help to hold the mirror still: one has oneself to remain still. "Instead, focus on the knower, that which is experiencing this, and calm that into stillness." (2002:78). According to Bhikkhu Bodhi "experiencing the mind" is to be understood by way of the fourth *jhāna* (2001 n1118). *Citta,* "mind," is synonymous with *mano* and *viññāṇa* (*Yaṁ… idaṁ vuccati cittan ti vā mano ti vā viññāṇan ti vā,* D 1:21; *Yaṁ ca kho etaṁ…vuccati cittam iti pi mano iti pi viññāṇa iti pi*, S 2:94 f), so too in most traditions following the Abhidharma period, but they were clearly differentiated within the Yogācāra. SA says that all the three are names for the mind-base (*man'āyatana*). See Bodhi, *Connected Discourses,* 2000:769 n154. See also ***Viññāṇa*** = SD 17.8 (4.1).

[51] "Gladdening the mind" (*abhippamodayaṁ cittaṁ*), ie shining the meditation sign. According to Brahmavaṁso, the mental reflex or meditation sign (*nimitta*) may appear to some as being "too dull" or "unstable," which are addressed by the 10th and 11th steps, respectively; "shining the *nimitta* and sustaining the *nimitta*… The more joy there is in the mind, the more brilliant shines the *nimitta.* To enter *Jhāna*, the *nimitta* has to be the most brilliant thing that you have ever seen, and an unearthly beauty." ("Beautiful Breath," 1999; 2002:74 f). Brahmavaṁso teaches 4 ways of shining the *nimitta* (here summarized): (1) focus on centre of the *nimitta*; (2) sharpen the attention in the present moment; (3) smile at the *nimitta*; (4) go back to the beautiful breath. (2002:76 f). The reflex may be dull also due to poor moral conduct or to low mental effort. In the case of poor moral conduct, one should "spend some effort purifying your conduct beyond the meditation cushion. Keep your precepts faultlessly. Check your speech. The Buddha said that without first purifying ***sīla*** [moral conduct], it is impossible to purify *samādhi* [mental condentration]." (2002:75). In the case of low mental effort, one should remedy it by switching to **"the inspirational meditations"** like a reflection (*anussati*) on any of the Three Jewels, on giving (*cāgânussati*) or *mettā,bhāvanā.* According to Bhikkhu Bodhi, "gladdening the mind" is either the attainment of the first 2 *jhāna* (containing joy) or as the penetration of those *jhāna* by regarding them with insight as subject to destruction. (2001 n1118)

[52] "Concentrating the mind" (*samādahaṁ cittaṁ*), ie sustaining the meditation sign (*nimitta*). Sometimes, "even the brilliant *nimitta* can appear unstable…it is just a reflection of the knower… If the knower moved so did [his] reflection, the *nimitta.*" ("Beautiful Breath," 1999). "It is common that the first few times that a *nimitta* appears, it flashes up for a short time and then disappears. Or else it moves around in the mental field of vision. It is unstable. Usually, the bright powerful *nimittas* remain longer [than] the dull weak ones…" (2002:78). The solution, according to Brahmavaṁso, is to "focus on the knower, that which is experiencing this, and calm that into stillness." (1999). "Once again, it is usually **fear or excitement** that creates the instability. You are reacting too much rather than passively observing. Experiencing the *nimitta* for the first time is like meeting a stranger for the first time. Often you are on the age because you do not know who they are or how they behave." (2002:78 f). He goes on to give the example of how one learns to cycle: "…you soon learn to stop gripping the *nimitta* like the child gripping the bicycle handlebars. You relax and discover that the more you ease off controlling the easier it is to sustain the *nimitta.*" Or, one deliberately surrenders the car keys to the *nimitta* to let it drive and one just sits back and relax. (2002 78 f). According to Bhikku Bodhi, "concentrating the mind" refers either to the concentration pertaining to the *jhāna* or to the momentary concentration that arises along with insight (2001 n1118)

He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, freeing the mind';

D. The fourth tetrad: Contemplation of dharmas[54]

[M 118.12]

13 (13) He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, contemplating impermanence';[55]
He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, contemplating impermanence';
(14) He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, contemplating the fading away (of lust)';[56]
He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, contemplating the fading away (of lust)';
(15) He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, contemplating the cessation (of suffering)';[57]
He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, contemplating the cessation (of suffering)';
(16) He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, contemplating the letting go (of defilements)';[58]
[59]He trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, contemplating the letting go (of defilements)';

14 [M 118.22] Ānanda, this is how the mindfulness of the in-and-out-breathing, when developed, often cultivated, is of great fruit and great benefit.

THE PERFECTION OF THE FOUR FOCUSSES OF MINDFULNESS

---

[53] "Freeing the mind" (*vimocayaṁ cittaṁ*). Here, according to Brahmavaṁso, "the mind usually has two experiences that are exactly the same, but just depending on your perspective. You either find yourself 'diving' into the *nimitta*... The attention just sinks in there. Or else that *nimitta*, that 'beautiful light' or 'feeling,' just completely 'envelops you.' 'You' don't do this…it just happens… You enter the *Jhāna* through freeing the mind. The Buddha called the *Jhānas* stages of freedom (*vimokkha*) [D 16.3.33, A 8.66]." ("Beautiful Breath," 1999; 2002:79-81). This is probably the most truly powerful experience in one's life, when one can really call oneself a "mystic." It is a kind of momentary "joy of awakening" (*sambodhi sukha,* M 1:454). This is an experience "where the mind is free from the body. I'm not saying that it's floating out somewhere like an out-of-body experience. You're just not located in space and time any more. All space and time have something to do with the body. Here the mind is free from all of that. You're just experiencing bliss. You're not at all sensitive to what's happening with the body." (2002:80). In fact, there is a total hibernation of the physical senses.

[54] These last following four stages relate to the meditator who has just emerged from the *jhāna.* The first thing one should do then is to review that state: "What was that?" "How did that arise?" "How do I feel?" "Why do I feel that way?" "What have I been doing all this time?" "What worked and what failed?" "What was the result of the meditation?" "Why is it happy?" All such reflections give rise to deep insight. Having reflected thus, "you either take up *Satipaṭṭhāna* (the Four Focusses of Mindfulness) or just go directly to the last four stages of *Ānāpānasati.*" The meditator has any one of these four following things [13-16] to contemplate on after emerging from the *jhāna*. (Brahmavaṁso, "Beautiful Breath," 1999; 2002:81-85). See also SD 13.1 (5D)(iv).

[55] "Impermanence," *anicca*. What we call the "self," something that appears to be so constant that we do not even notice it. In *jhāna,* it disappears. If you experience this deeply as "not-self," "it's very likely to give rise to the experience of Stream Winning." (Brahmavaṁso, "Beautiful Breath," 1999; 2002:82).

[56] "Fading away," *virāga*, also tr as "dispassion" (see §42). If reflections on impermanence does not work, then one should go on to reflect on the "fading away" (*virāga*). "This is when things just disappear…things which were so close to you, that you thought were an essential part of you…" (Brahmavaṁso, "Beautiful Breath," 1999).

[57] "Cessation," *nirodha.* Something that was once there had now disappeared. "So much of the universe that you knew has ceased, and you're in a completely different space…what you thought was important has gone… Cessation is also the Third Noble Truth [the cessation of suffering]. The cause of that cessation is letting go…And what's left?...the opposite of *dukkha*…it is *sukha* (happiness). The ending of suffering is happiness." (Brahmavaṁso, "Beautiful Breath," 1999; 2002:82 f).

[58] "Letting go," *paṭinissagga,* or "abandoning." "In this context *Paṭinissagga* is not giving away what's 'out there,' but giving away what's 'in here'…the letting go of the 'doer,'…even of the 'knower'…especially letting go of… the 'will,' the 'controller.' This is the path to the end of suffering. (Brahmavaṁso, "Beautiful Breath," 1999; 2002:82 f).

[59] While the previous three tetrads deal with both calm and insight, this tetrad deals only with insight. "Contemplating the fading away…" and "contemplating the cessation…" can be understood both as insight into the impermanence of formations and as the supramundane path leading to Nirvana, that is, the fading of lust (*virāga*) and the cessation of suffering. "Contemplating the letting go…" is the giving up of defilements through insight and the gaining of Nirvana through the path.

[= Ānâpāna,sati Sutta (M 118.24-27/3:83,20-85,6)]

(A) The 1st tetrad: The contemplation of the body

15 [M 10.24] Ānanda,

(1) when a monk is breathing in long, he knows [he understands]: 'I breathe in long [Long in-breath]';[60]
or, when he is breathing out long, he knows: 'I breathe out long [Long out-breath]';

(2) or, when he is breathing in short, he knows: 'I breathe in short [Short in-breath]';
or, when he is breathing out short, he knows: 'I breathe out short [Short out-breath]';

(3) or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, experiencing the whole body';
or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, experiencing the whole body';

(4) or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, calming the bodily function[61] (of breathing)';
or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, calming the bodily function (of breathing)';

—then, Ānanda, exertive, fully aware, mindful,[62] the monk dwells **contemplating the body in the body**,[63] removing[64] covetousness and displeasure[65] for the world.[66]

---

[60] See §18(1-2) n.

[61] *Kāya,saṅkhāra,* see §18(4)n.

[62] *Ātāpī sampajāno satimā, vineyya loke abhijjhā,domanassaṁ* here is essentially synonymous with *vigatâbhijjho vigata,vyāpādo asammūḷho sampajāno patissato* mentioned in connection with the four Divine Abodes (*brahma,vihāra*) (**Kesaputtiyā S**, A 65.15/1:192). Their application, however, differ: the former points to the *result* of meditation, while the latter is a *part* of the meditation process itself. On *sampajāno satimā,* see Vism 4.174/163 which explains that clear knowledge (*sampajañña*) has the characteristic of non-confusion; its function is to investigate and manifested as scrutiny. Mindfulness (*sati*) has the characteristic of remembering. Its function is not to forget and is manifested as guarding. *Sampajāno* is also tr as "clearly comprehending," "fully understanding" (see M:ÑB 2001 n147).

[63] "Contemplating the body in the body," *kāye kāyânupassī,* ie "one who contemplates the body as the body"; §25 "contemplating feelings in the feelings," §26 "contemplating mind in the mind, and §27 "contemplating dharmas in the dharmas." In each case, they are not to be seen as "This is mine" (*etam mama*) (which arises through craving, *taṇhā*), or as "This I am" (*eso'ham asmi*) (due to conceit, *māna*), or as "This is my self" (*eso me attā*) (due to wrong view, *diṭṭhi*) (Anattā,lakkhaṇa S, S 3:68). In short, such experiences are not "beliefs" but direct experiences of reality. See Peter Harvey, *The Selfless Mind*, 1995:32 f.

[64] *Vineyya,* this means that the five hindrances have to be abandoned *prior* to practising *satipaṭṭhāna*. This is because the hindrances, in the form of mental impurities (*cetaso upakkilesa*), weaken wisdom (*paññāya dubbalī,-karaṇe*) (D 2:83, 3:49, 101, A 2:211, 3:93, 100, 386 f, Vbh 245, 256). In **Naḷakapāna S** (M 68), the Buddha tells Anuruddha, "While [a son of good family] still does not attain to joy and happiness that are secluded from sensual pleasures and secluded from unwholesome states, or to something more peaceful than that, covetousness [and the other four hindrances] will invade his mind and remain…" (M 68.6/1:463). (I thank Ajahn Brahmavaṁso for pointing this out.)

[65] "Covetousness and displeasure," *abhijjhā,domanassaṃ,* which Walshe (1995:335 & n632) renders as "hankering and fretting for the world"; alt tr "covetousness and displeasure" or "longing and loathing." MA says that "covetousness and displeasure" here signify the first two hindrances—sensual desire and ill will—principal hindrances to be overcome for the practice to succeed. They thus represent the contemplation of dharmas, which begins with the five hindrances (*pañca nīvaraṇā*: sensual lust, desire, ill will, restless and worry, sloth and torpor, doubt): see **Saṅgārava S** (S 46.55 = SD 3.12). Cf M 1:274/39.13; see also **Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S** (D 22.13) and **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10.36) on how to deal with the hindrances in one's meditation. The monk effects the abandoning of the hindrances by the contemplations of impermanence, fading away (of lust), cessation (of suffering) and letting go (of defilements), and thus comes to look upon the object with equanimity. On *abhijjhā,domanassa,* there is an interesting related passage from **Pubba or Pubb'eva Sambodha S**: "Monks, before my awakening, when I was still a bodhisattva, this thought occurred to me…'Whatever physical and mental joy (*sukha,somanassa*) there is in the world, that is the gratification (*assāda*) in the world; that the world is impermanent, suffering and of the nature to change, that is the wretchedness (*ādīnava*) in the world—the removal and abandoning of desire and lust for the world, that is the escape from the world.'" (A 1:258/3.101, pointed out to me by Robert Eddison). My understanding

16 Ānanda, this in-and-out-breathing is a certain body amongst the bodies,[67] I say.

Therefore, Ānanda, a monk, exertive, fully aware, mindful, dwells contemplating the body in the body,[68] removing covetousness and displeasure for the world.

(B) The 2nd tetrad: The contemplation of feelings **[Entry into dhyana]**

17 [M 10.25] Ānanda,

(5) or, when a monk trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, experiencing joy [zest]';[69]
or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, experiencing joy [zest]';

(6) or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, experiencing happiness';
or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, experiencing happiness';

(7) or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, knowing the mental formations [mental functions]';[70]
or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, **[324]** knowing the mental formations [mental functions]';

(8) or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, calming the mental formations [mental functions]';
or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, calming the mental formations [mental functions]';

—then, the monk, exertive, fully aware, mindful, dwells **contemplating feelings in the feelings**,[71] removing covetousness and displeasure for the world.

18 Ānanda, full attention[72] to the in-and-out-breathing[73] is a certain feeling amongst the feelings,[74] I

---

here regarding the naming of the first two mental hindrances as *abhijjhā,domanassa* is to show that with their elimination the other hindrances are eliminated, too—a view confirmed by Brahmavaṁso (30 March 2003).

[66] "World" (*loka*). The Vibhaṅga says: "This very body is the world, and the five aggregates of clinging (i.e. form, feeling, perception, formations and consciousness) are the world—this is called the world." (Vbh 195). However, in his amplified tr at Vibh 105, U Thittila has "world (i.e., in ideational objects)" (*dhammā*, mental objects) (Vibh:T 139).

[67] "*A* certain body amongst the bodies," *kāyesu kāy'aññatara*. Comy say: "I call it the wind body (*vāyo,kāya*) among the bodies of the four elements. Or else, it is a 'certain kind of body' because it is included in the tactile base amongst the various components of the form body." (SA 3:271). Nyanaponika: "one of the bodily processes" (1962: 167). This sentence is missing from Thich Nhat Hanh 1990. The breath is "a body" because it is a part of the "body of air" (*vāyo,kāya*) or the air element (*vāyo dhātu*), one of the four primary elements (*mahā,bhūta*) making up the body (and everything else). It is included in the base of tangibles among bodily phenolmena because the object of attention is the touch sensation of the breath entering and exiting the nostrils), that is, it is included in the sense of touch (or "tangible object base ," *phoṭṭabb'āyatana*). (M:ÑB 2002 n1122). See MA 4:140. Cf §18(3)n. See **Ānâpāna,sati S** (M 118) = SD 7.13 ad loc & **Satipaṭṭhāna Suttas** = SD 13.1 Introd (3.4).

[68] DA (on the Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S) explains why "body" is used twice here: "For determining the object and isolating it," which Ñāṇamoli paraphrases as "This means not confusing, during meditation, body with feeling, mind, etc. The body is contemplated just as body, feelings just as feelings, etc." (2001 n138 on the Satipaṭṭhāna S).

[69] "Joy," *pīti,* see §19(5)n.

[70] "Mental functions," *citta,saṅkhāra*, see §19(7)n.

[71] "Contemplating feelings in the feelings," *vedanāsu vedanā'nupassī,* ie "one who contemplates feeling as feelings." See §24n.

[72] MA explains that full (or "bare") attention (*sādhuka manasikāra*) is not itself actually feeling, but is spoken of as such only figuratively. In the second tetrad, the actual feeling is the happiness mentioned in the second clause and also the feeling connoted by the expression "mental formations" in the third and fourth clauses.

[73] "Full attention to the in-and-out-breathing" (*assāsa,passāsaṁ sādhukaṁ manasikāraṁ*). Comy: Attention is not really pleasant feeling, but this is a heading of the teaching. In this tetrad, in the first verse (*pada*) feeling is alluded to under the heading of 'rapture'; in the second verse, it is directly found as 'happiness.' In the third and fourth verses, feeling is included in the mental formation [*saññā ca vedanā ca citta,saṅkhāro,* S 4:293]." (SA 3:271)

[74] "A certain feeling amongst the feelings," *vedanāsu vedanā'ññatara.* There are three types of feeling: pleasant (*sukhaṁ*), unpleasant (*dukkhaṁ*) and neutral (*adukkham-asukhaṁ*)—one contemplates one any of these as each

say .

Therefore, Ānanda, a monk, exertive, fully aware, mindful, dwells contemplating feelings in the feelings, removing covetousness and displeasure for the world.

(C) The 3rd tetrad: The contemplation of the Mind

19 [M 10.26] Ānanda,

(9) when a monk trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, experiencing the mind';
or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, experiencing the mind';

(10) or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, gladdening the mind';
or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, gladdening the mind';

(11) or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, concentrating the mind';
or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, concentrating the mind';

(12) or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, freeing the mind';
or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, freeing the mind';

—then, the monk, exertive, fully aware, mindful, dwells **contemplating the mind in the mind**,[75] removing covetousness and displeasure for the world.

20 I do not say that there is the mindfulness of the in-and-out-breathing for one who is confused, who lacks full knowing.

Therefore, Ānanda, a monk, exertive, fully aware, mindful, dwells contemplating mind in the mind, removing covetousness and displeasure for the world.

(D) The 4th tetrad: The contemplation of dharmas [Emerging from dhyana]

21 [M 10.27] Ānanda,

(13) when a monk trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, contemplating impermanence';
or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, contemplating impermanence';

(14) or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, contemplating the fading away[76] [of lust]';
or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, contemplating the fading away [of lust]';

(15) or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, contemplating the cessation [of suffering]';
or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, contemplating the cessation [of suffering]';

(16) or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe in, contemplating the letting go[77] [of defilements]';
or, when he trains himself thus: 'I will breathe out, contemplating the letting go [of defilements]';

---

arise. Cf §24n on "a certain body amongst the bodies." Comy to Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta says that it is not easy to be mindful of neutral feeling, and that it should be best approached by way of inference, by noting the absence of both pleasant and unpleasant feelings. Comy illustrates with the example of a hunter seeing tracks before and after a rock, thereby inferring the track of an animal (MA 1:277). **Dhamma,saṅgaṇī** says that only the sense of touch is accompanied by pain or pleasure, while feelings arising at the other four sense-doors are invariably neutral (Dhs 139-145; Abhds 2). The suttas however speak of pleasant and unpleasant sights, sounds, smells, and tastes, that in turn condition the arising of corresponding feelings of pleasure or displeasure (S 4:115, 119, 125, 126). "This *Abhidhammic* presentation offers an intriguing perspective on contemplation of feeling, since it invites an inquiry into the degree to which an experience of delight or displeasure in regard to sight, sound, smell or taste is simply the outcome of one's own mental evaluation" (Anālayo, *Satipaṭṭhāna,* 2003:171). See discussion in **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10) = SD 10.1 Introd (3.4-7).

[75] "Contemplating the mind in the mind." See §24n. MA says that although the meditator takes as his object the sign of the in-and-out-breathing, he is said to be "contemplating mind in the mind" because he maintains his mind on the object by arousing mindfulness and full understanding, two factors of mind.

[76] "Fading away," *virāga*, also translated as "dispassion." [§42]

[77] See §21(16)n.

—then, Ānanda, the monk, exertive, fully aware, mindful, dwells **contemplating dharmas in the dharmas,**[78] removing covetousness and displeasure for the world.

Having seen with wisdom the abandonment of covetousness and displeasure, he closely looks on with equanimity.[79]

Therefore, Ānanda, exertive, fully aware, mindful, a monk dwells contemplating dharmas in the dharmas, removing covetousness and displeasure for the world. **[325]**

Parable of the chariots at the crossroads

22 Suppose, Ānanda, at a crossroads there is a great mound of soil. If a cart or chariot were to come from the east,…from the west,…from the north,…from the south, it would flatten that mound of earth.[80]

So, too, Ānanda, when a monk dwells contemplating the body in the body,…contemplating feelings in the feelings,…contemplating the mind in the mind,…contemplating dharmas in the dharmas, he would "flatten" evil unwholesome states.

—evaṁ—

Bibliography

Ñāṇamoli
1964 *Mindfulness of Breathing (Ānāpānasati).* Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society, 1964.

v1.13
050602; rev 060329

[78] "Dharmas" (*dhammā*) here refers to "mind-objects" or "the nature of things" that arise in the mind. See **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10) = SD 10.1 Introd (5D).

[79] Here, when the hindrances are abandoned (even temporarily), insight is cultivated. Comy: Here "**covetousness**" (*abhijjhā*) is only the hindrance of sensual lust; by "**displeasure**" (*domanassa*) is meant the hindrance of ill will.* This tetrad is stated by way of insight only. These two hindrances are the first of the five hindrances, the first section in the contemplation of dharmas. Thus he says this to show the beginning of the contemplation of dharmas. By "abandonment" (*pahānaṁ*) is meant the knowledge that effects abandoning, eg, one abandons the perception of permanence by the contemplation of impermanence. By the words "having seen with wisdom" (*paññāya disvā*), he shows the sequence of insights, thus: "With one insight knowledge, he sees the knowledge of abandonment, that is, the knowledges of impermanence, dispassion, ending, and letting go; and that, too, he sees by yet another." "He closely looks on with equanimity" (*sādhukaṁ ajjhupekkhitā hoti*): one is said to look on with equanimity when one has fare along the path, and when one has established oneness (of mind). "Looking on with equanimity" (*ajjhupekkhanā*) can also refer the conascent mental states (in meditation) or to the object. Here, the looking on at the object is intended. (SA 3:272 f).

[*Although "**covetousness and displeasure**" is taken by the sutta Commentary to refer to only the first two mental hindrances (*nīvaraṇā*), sensual lust and ill will, in the early Suttas, the dvandva is clearly a synecdoche (or short form) for all the five hindrances (*pañca,nīvaraṇā*) themselves, whose removal leads to mindfulness (*sati*), mental concentration (*samādhi*) and dhyana (*jhāna*). See SD 13.1(4.2e).]

[80] On this parable, see above Introd (2.3).